What is the writer’s thesis or main/controlling idea? (A thesis is “a single idea, clearly focused and specifically stated, that grows out of your exploration of a subject,” Harbrace.) Try to restate the thesis in your own words. If the thesis is not immediately apparent, what appears to stand out as the central focus, or best idea, after you have read the entire essay?

Does the thesis fulfill the requirements of the assignment?  Y   N
Does the thesis offer a sufficiently unified, narrow, and specific focus for the whole essay?  Y   N

If you answered “No” to either of the above, can you help the writer develop a better thesis from material in other parts of his/her paper?

Originality:  Did the writer tell you something you didn't already know just by reading the class texts?  Y   N
(An effective essay “develops an authentic, fresh insight that challenges the reader’s thinking.  The paper shows a complex, curious mind at work.  Caution….‘fresh’ should not be confused with ‘startling’”—Dr. Michael Mikolajczak.)

Coherence:  Do all the paragraphs of the essay relate to the thesis and to each other?  Y   N
If not, is there any way to connect the material that seems disconnected?

Organization:  Does the structure of the essay make sense—was it smooth and easy to follow?  Were points made in a logical order, and made only once rather than repeated?  Y   N

Textual evidence:  Did the writer cite the class texts fully enough so that you could readily see what
he/she based his/her observations upon?    Y    N
(“Through telling detail, the writer helps the reader experience what she/he is saying”—Dr. Michael Mikolajczak.)

Does the writer make clear the relevance of the passage(s) chosen to the point being made?    Y    N

Please provide the writer with two additional pieces of textual evidence that would support her/his point that she/he didn’t think of!

1. 

2. 

What has the writer done a particularly good job on?

What should be the writer’s top priorities as he or she revises? Please be as specific as possible and try to address any concerns or questions the writer him/herself asked for help on in the writer’s memo.

Note: Comments on the worksheet should NOT focus on grammar. As you read the drafts, if you notice errors in punctuation, grammar, or spelling, you may wish to mark them on the draft so that the writer can consider them later, but do not spend time here addressing editorial issues—doing this could leave a writer feeling that you are not interested in the content of what she/he has to say!