WHAT WE REALLY VALUE
WHAT WE REALLY VALUE
Beyond Rubrics in Teaching
and Assessing Writing

BOB BROAD

UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Logan, Utah
for

JULIE SUZANNE HILE
my finest friend, partner, and teacher

and for

DYLAN AND RACHEL
who make everything so much more worthwhile

in memory of

MAURICE SCHARTON
teacher, colleague, writing assessment dude
# CONTENTS

List of Figures viii  
List of Tables viii  
Prologue ix  
Acknowledgments xiii  
1 To Tell the Truth: Beyond Rubrics 1  
2 Studying Rubric-Free Assessment at City University: Research Context and Methods 16  
3 Textual Criteria: What They Really Valued, Part 1 32  
4 Contextual Criteria: What They Really Valued, Part 2 73  
5 A Model for Dynamic Criteria Mapping of Communal Writing Assessment 119  
Appendix A: Assignments for English 1 Essays 139  
Appendix B: Selected Sample Texts from City University 142  
Midterm essays 142  
"Anguish" 142  
"Gramma Sally" 144  
"Pops" 146  
End-term portfolios 148  
Portfolio 2 148  
"Professional Helper" (from Portfolio 3) 156  
Portfolio 4 157  
Appendix C: Tabulation of Votes on Sample Texts 165  
Appendix D: Sample Interview Questions 166  
Appendix E: Explanation of References to City University Transcripts 167  
References 169  
Index 173
LIST OF FIGURES

1 Structure of the Portfolio Program at City University 19
2 Overview of Dynamic Criteria Mapping for City University 33
3 Dynamic Criteria Mapping for City University’s Textual Qualities 39
   Dynamic Criteria Map (large format) (back cover pocket)
4 The Epistemic Spectrum 41
5 Change in Student Author 43
6 Empty, Hollow, Clichéd 49
7 Aesthetic Constellation 51
8 Agency/Power Constellation 52
9 Ethos Constellation 56
10 Part-to-Whole Constellation 58

LIST OF TABLES

1 Chronology of Key Communal Events in City University’s Portfolio Program 22
2 Quantitative Analysis of All Criteria for Judgment 34
3 City University’s Textual Features 62
4 City University’s Contextual Criteria 74