

Thinking and Writing in College

A Naturalistic Study of Students
in Four Disciplines

Barbara E. Walvoord
Loyola College in Maryland

Lucille Parkinson McCarthy
University of Maryland Baltimore County

In collaboration with

Virginia Johnson Anderson
Towson State University

John R. Breihan
Loyola College in Maryland

Susan Miller Robison
College of Notre Dame of Maryland

A. Kimbrough Sherman
Loyola College in Maryland

National Council of Teachers of English
1111 Kenyon Road, Urbana, IL 61801

NCTE Editorial Board: Richard Abrahamson; Celia Genishi; Richard Lloyd-Jones; Joyce Kinkead; Gladys Veidemanis; Charles Suhor, ex officio; Michael Spooner, ex officio.

Staff Editor: Mary Daniels

Cover Design: Doug Burnett

Interior Book Design: Tom Kovacs for TGK Design

NCTE Stock Number 54247-3020

© 1990 by the National Council of Teachers of English. All rights reserved.
Printed in the United States of America.

It is the policy of NCTE and its journals and other publications to provide a forum for open discussion of ideas concerning the content and the teaching of English and the language arts. Publicity accorded to any particular point of view does not imply endorsement by the Executive Committee, the Board of Directors, or the membership at large, except in announcements of policy, where such endorsement is clearly specified.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Thinking and writing in college : a naturalistic study of students in
four disciplines / Barbara E. Walvoord . . . [et al.].

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-8141-5424-7

1. Thought and thinking—Study and teaching (Higher)—United States. 2. English language—Rhetoric—Study and teaching—United States. 3. Reasoning—Study and teaching (Higher)—United States.

4. Learning. I. Walvoord, Barbara E. Fessler, 1941-

LB2395.35.T47 1991

378.1'7—dc20

91-18272

CIP

To Mina P. Shaughnessy, who taught us to respect the "intelligence and will" that students bring to their academic writing, and who helped us see our world through students' eyes. She gave us a vision of teachers and researchers who "look at students' difficulties in a more fruitful way" and hence who learn "to teach anew."

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1. Preview of the Book	1
Barbara E. Walvoord	
Lucille Parkinson McCarthy	
Purposes of the Book	2
The Need for Our Study	3
The Team’s Research Questions	3
Similarities among The Four Classrooms	6
Organization of the Four Classroom Chapters	15
2. Research Theory and Methods	17
Lucille Parkinson McCarthy	
Barbara E. Walvoord	
The Researchers and the Students	17
Our Inquiry Paradigm and Research Assumptions	19
Data Collection Methods	22
Data Analysis Procedures	33
Our Team’s Shared Assumptions and Ways of Working	44
Ensuring the Trustworthiness of Our Team’s Findings and Interpretations	48
3. Managerial Decision Making: Sherman’s Business Course	50
Barbara E. Walvoord	
A. Kimbrough Sherman	
Sherman’s Expectations	51
Difficulties with Gathering Sufficient Specific Information	55
	vii

Difficulties with Constructing the Audience and the Self	66
Difficulties with Stating a Position	71
Two Interrelated Difficulties: Using Discipline-Based Methods to Arrive at (and Support) a Position; Managing Complexity	74
Difficulties with Organizing the Papers	88
Pre-Draft Writing	90
Sherman's Response to Drafts	92
Sherman's and Walvoord's Conclusions	94
4. Arguing and Debating: Breihan's History Course	97
Barbara E. Walvoord	
John R. Breihan	
Breihan's Expectations	99
Difficulties with Stating a Position	102
Difficulties with Managing Complexity: Counterargument	111
Difficulties with Using Discipline-Based Methods to Arrive at (and Support) a Position	120
Breihan's and Walvoord's Conclusions	141
5. Using Social Science to Help Oneself and Others: Robison's Human Sexuality Course	144
Barbara E. Walvoord	
Susan Miller Robison	
Roles in Robison's Course	144
Robison's Expectations	150
Difficulties with Constructing the Audience and the Self	153
Three Interrelated Difficulties: Stating a Position; Using Discipline-Based Methods to Arrive (and Support) a Position; Managing Complexity	165
Pre-Draft Writing	168
Responses to Drafts	171
Robison's and Walvoord's Conclusions	175

6. Conducting and Reporting Original Scientific Research: Anderson's Biology Class	177
Virginia Johnson Anderson Barbara E. Walvoord	
Anderson's Expectations	178
Anderson's 1983 Teaching Methods	189
Our Methods of Data Collection and Analysis	191
Difficulties with Constructing the Audience and the Self	193
Four Interrelated Difficulties: Stating a Position; Using Discipline-Based Methods to Arrive at (and Support) a Position; Managing Complexity; Gathering Sufficient Specific Information	200
Difficulties with Organizing the Papers	219
Anderson's and Walvoord's Conclusions	225
7. Conclusion	228
Barbara E. Walvoord Lucille Parkinson McCarthy	
Teachers' Expectations	228
Areas of Difficulty	231
How Students' Strategies and Teachers' Methods Appeared to Affect the Difficulties	232
What Classroom Research Meant to Us	242
<i>Appendix A: Primary Trait Analysis for Anderson's Biology Class</i>	243
<i>Appendix B: Characteristics of Entire Classes and Focus Groups</i>	248
<i>Works Cited</i>	250
<i>Index</i>	260
<i>The Research Team</i>	268