RETHINKING PEER REVIEW
CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON A PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICE

Edited by
Phoebe Jackson
and Christopher Weaver
RETHINKING PEER REVIEW:
CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON A
PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICE
The Perspectives on Writing series addresses writing studies in a broad sense. Consistent with the wide ranging approaches characteristic of teaching and scholarship in writing across the curriculum, the series presents works that take divergent perspectives on working as a writer, teaching writing, administering writing programs, and studying writing in its various forms.

The WAC Clearinghouse and University Press of Colorado are collaborating so that these books will be widely available through free digital distribution and low-cost print editions. The publishers and the series editors are committed to the principle that knowledge should freely circulate and have embraced the use of technology to support open access to scholarly work.

Recent Books in the Series

Megan J. Kelly, Heather M. Falconer, Caleb L. González, and Jill Dahlman (Eds.), *Adapting the Past to Reimagine Possible Futures: Celebrating and Critiquing WAC at 50* (2023)

William J. Macauley, Jr. et al. (Eds.), *Threshold Conscripts: Rhetoric and Composition Teaching Assistantships* (2023)

Jennifer Grouling, *Adapting VALUEs: Tracing the Life of a Rubric through Institutional Ethnography* (2022)

Chris M. Anson and Pamela Flash (Eds.), *Writing-Enriched Curricula: Models of Faculty-Driven and Departmental Transformation* (2021)


Alexandria L. Lockett, Iris D. Ruiz, James Chase Sanchez, and Christopher Carter (Eds.), *Race, Rhetoric, and Research Methods* (2021)


Ryan J. Dippre and Talinn Phillips (Eds.), *Approaches to Lifespan Writing Research: Generating an Actionable Coherence* (2020)

Lesley Erin Bartlett, Sandra L. Tarabochia, Andrea R. Olinger, and Margaret J. Marshall (Eds.), *Diverse Approaches to Teaching, Learning, and Writing Across the Curriculum: IWAC at 25* (2020)


Mark Sutton and Sally Chandler (Eds.), *The Writing Studio Sampler: Stories About Change* (2018)
RETHINKING PEER REVIEW: CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON A PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICE

Edited by Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver

The WAC Clearinghouse
wac.colostate.edu
Fort Collins, Colorado

University Press of Colorado
upcolorado.com
Denver, Colorado
CONTENTS

Introduction. Rethinking and Reframing Peer Review ........................................... 3
Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver

PART ONE. PEER REVIEW: EVALUATING THE CHALLENGES .................................... 15
Chapter 1. Teachers’ Beliefs about the Language of Peer Review:
Survey-Based Evidence .................................................................................................. 17
Ian G. Anson, Chris M. Anson, and Kendra L. Andrews
Chapter 2. Resisting Theory: The Wisdom of the Creative Writing
Workshop ....................................................................................................................... 41
Bob Mayberry
Chapter 3. A Troubled Practice: Three Models of Peer Review and
the Problems Underlying Them ..................................................................................... 59
Christopher Weaver

PART TWO. PEER REVIEW: RHETORICALLY SITUATED ........................................... 73
Chapter 4. Interrogating Peer Review as “Proxy:” Reframing Peer
Response within Connective Practice ........................................................................... 75
Kay Halasek
Chapter 5. Peer Persuasion: An Ethos-Based Theory of Identification
and Audience Awareness ............................................................................................... 99
Courtney Stanton
Chapter 6. Positioning Peer Review for Transfer: Authentic Audiences
for Career Readiness and Workplace Communication ................................................. 119
Nora McCook

PART THREE. PEER REVIEW: CULTIVATING INCLUSIVENESS ................................. 145
Chapter 7. Peer Review and the Benefits of Anxiety in the Academic
Writing Classroom .......................................................................................................... 147
Ellen Turner
Chapter 8. Multimodal Peer Review: Fostering Inclusion in Mixed
Level College Classrooms with ELL Learners ............................................................ 169
Beth Kramer

PART FOUR. PEER REVIEW: THE PROMISE OF TECHNOLOGY ................................. 185
Chapter 9. Leveling the Playing Field for ELL Students: The Case for
Moving Peer Review to an Online Environment ......................................................... 187
Vicki Pallo
Contents

Chapter 10. Learning from Peer Review Online: Changing the Pedagogical Emphasis......................... 205
Phoebe Jackson

Chapter 11. The Potential of Peer Review Software that Focuses on the Review, Not the Draft.................. 229
Nick Carbone

Afterword. Accepting, Sharing, and Surrendering Control: Combining the Best of Old and New in Peer Review and Response...... 245
Steven J. Corbett

Contributors ................................................... 257

Index .......................................................... 261