RETHINKING PEER REVIEW

CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON A PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICE

Perspectives on Writing

Edited by
Phoebe Jackson
and Christopher Weaver

RETHINKING PEER REVIEW: CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON A PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICE

PERSPECTIVES ON WRITING

Series Editors: Rich Rice, Heather MacNeill Falconer, and J. Michael Rifenburg
Consulting Editor: Susan H. McLeod | Associate Editor: Olivia Johnson

The Perspectives on Writing series addresses writing studies in a broad sense. Consistent with the wide ranging approaches characteristic of teaching and scholarship in writing across the curriculum, the series presents works that take divergent perspectives on working as a writer, teaching writing, administering writing programs, and studying writing in its various forms.

The WAC Clearinghouse and University Press of Colorado are collaborating so that these books will be widely available through free digital distribution and low-cost print editions. The publishers and the series editors are committed to the principle that knowledge should freely circulate and have embraced the use of technology to support open access to scholarly work.

Recent Books in the Series

Megan J. Kelly, Heather M. Falconer, Caleb L. González, and Jill Dahlman (Eds.), *Adapting the Past to Reimagine Possible Futures: Celebrating and Critiquing WAC at 50* (2023)

William J. Macauley, Jr. et al. (Eds.), *Threshold Conscripts: Rhetoric and Composition Teaching Assistantships* (2023)

Jennifer Grouling, *Adapting VALUEs: Tracing the Life of a Rubric through Institutional Ethnography* (2022)

Chris M. Anson and Pamela Flash (Eds.), *Writing-Enriched Curricula: Models of Faculty-Driven and Departmental Transformation* (2021)

Asao B. Inoue, *Above the Well: An Antiracist Argument From a Boy of Color* (2021)

Alexandria L. Lockett, Iris D. Ruiz, James Chase Sanchez, and Christopher Carter (Eds.), *Race, Rhetoric, and Research Methods* (2021)

Kristopher M. Lotier, *Postprocess Postmortem* (2021)

Ryan J. Dippre and Talinn Phillips (Eds.), *Approaches to Lifespan Writing Research: Generating an Actionable Coherence* (2020)

Lesley Erin Bartlett, Sandra L. Tarabochia, Andrea R. Olinger, and Margaret J. Marshall (Eds.), *Diverse Approaches to Teaching, Learning, and Writing Across the Curriculum: IWAC at 25* (2020)

Hannah J. Rule, *Situating Writing Processes* (2019)

Asao B. Inoue, *Labor-Based Grading Contracts: Building Equity and Inclusion in the Compassionate Writing Classroom* (2019)

Mark Sutton and Sally Chandler (Eds.), *The Writing Studio Sampler: Stories About Change* (2018)

RETHINKING PEER REVIEW: CRITICAL REFLECTIONS ON A PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICE

Edited by Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver

The WAC Clearinghouse
wac.colostate.edu
Fort Collins, Colorado

University Press of Colorado
upcolorado.com
Denver, Colorado

The WAC Clearinghouse, Fort Collins, Colorado 80523

University Press of Colorado, Denver, Colorado 80202

© 2023 by Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International license.

ISBN 978-1-64215-196-1 (PDF) | 978-1-64215-197-8 (ePub) | 978-1-64642-503-7 (pbk.)

DOI 10.37514/PER-B.2023.1961

Produced in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Jackson, Phoebe, editor. | Weaver, Christopher C., 1962- editor.
Title: Rethinking peer review : critical reflections on a pedagogical practice / Edited by Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver.
Description: Fort Collins, Colorado : The WAC Clearinghouse; University Press of Colorado, 2023. | Series: Perspectives on writing | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2023029001 (print) | LCCN 2023029002 (ebook) | ISBN 9781646425037 (paperback) | ISBN 9781642151961 (adobe pdf) | ISBN 9781642151978 (epub)
Subjects: LCSH: Peer review. | Writing--Study and teaching (Higher) | English language--Rhetoric--Study and teaching (Higher) | Critical pedagogy. | English language--Study and teaching (Higher)--Foreign speakers.
Classification: LCC LB1031.5 .R48 2023 (print) | LCC LB1031.5 (ebook) | DDC 371.39/4--dc23/eng/20230713
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023029001
LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2023029002

Copyeditor: Caitlin Kahihikolo
Designer: Mike Palmquist
Cover Photo: "College Students Studying Together in a Library," by Monkey Business Images (Shutterstock 15590890). Licensed.
Series Editors: Rich Rice, Heather MacNeill Falconer, and J. Michael Rifenburg
Consulting Editor: Susan H. McLeod
Associate Editor: Olivia Johnson

The WAC Clearinghouse supports teachers of writing across the disciplines. Hosted by Colorado State University, it brings together scholarly journals and book series as well as resources for teachers who use writing in their courses. This book is available in digital formats for free download at wac.colostate.edu.

Founded in 1965, the University Press of Colorado is a nonprofit cooperative publishing enterprise supported, in part, by Adams State University, Colorado State University, Fort Lewis College, Metropolitan State University of Denver, University of Alaska Fairbanks, University of Colorado, University of Denver, University of Northern Colorado, University of Wyoming, Utah State University, and Western Colorado University. For more information, visit upcolorado.com.

Land Acknowledgment. The Colorado State University Land Acknowledgment can be found at landacknowledgment.colostate.edu.

CONTENTS

Introduction. Rethinking and Reframing Peer Review 3
Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver

Part One. Peer Review: Evaluating the Challenges 15

Chapter 1. Teachers' Beliefs about the Language of Peer Review: Survey-Based Evidence 17
Ian G. Anson, Chris M. Anson, and Kendra L. Andrews

Chapter 2. Resisting Theory: The Wisdom of the Creative Writing Workshop. 41
Bob Mayberry

Chapter 3. A Troubled Practice: Three Models of Peer Review and the Problems Underlying Them 59
Christopher Weaver

Part Two. Peer Review: Rhetorically Situated 73

Chapter 4. Interrogating Peer Review as "Proxy:" Reframing Peer Response within Connective Practice 75
Kay Halasek

Chapter 5. Peer Persuasion: An Ethos-Based Theory of Identification and Audience Awareness. 99
Courtney Stanton

Chapter 6. Positioning Peer Review for Transfer: Authentic Audiences for Career Readiness and Workplace Communication 119
Nora McCook

Part Three. Peer Review: Cultivating Inclusiveness 145

Chapter 7. Peer Review and the Benefits of Anxiety in the Academic Writing Classroom 147
Ellen Turner

Chapter 8. Multimodal Peer Review: Fostering Inclusion in Mixed Level College Classrooms with ELL Learners 169
Beth Kramer

Part Four. Peer Review: The Promise of Technology 185

Chapter 9. Leveling the Playing Field for ELL Students: The Case for Moving Peer Review to an Online Environment 187
Vicki Pallo

Chapter 10. Learning from Peer Review Online: Changing the Pedagogical Emphasis 205
Phoebe Jackson

Chapter 11. The Potential of Peer Review Software that Focuses on the Review, Not the Draft 229
Nick Carbone

Afterword. Accepting, Sharing, and Surrendering Control: Combining the Best of Old and New in Peer Review and Response 245
Steven J. Corbett

Contributors 257

Index 261