

CONSIDERING STUDENTS, TEACHERS, AND WRITING ASSESSMENT

VOLUME 1, TECHNICAL
AND POLITICAL CONTEXTS



Perspectives
on Writing

Edited by
Diane Kelly-Riley
Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus

CONSIDERING STUDENTS,
TEACHERS, AND WRITING
ASSESSMENT: VOLUME 1,
TECHNICAL AND POLITICAL
CONTEXTS

PERSPECTIVES ON WRITING

Series Editors: Rich Rice and J. Michael Rifenburg

Consulting Editor: Susan H. McLeod

Associate Editors: Jonathan M. Marine, Johanna Phelps, and Qingyang Sun

The Perspectives on Writing series addresses writing studies in a broad sense. Consistent with the wide ranging approaches characteristic of teaching and scholarship in writing across the curriculum, the series presents works that take divergent perspectives on working as a writer, teaching writing, administering writing programs, and studying writing in its various forms.

The WAC Clearinghouse and University Press of Colorado are collaborating so that these books will be widely available through free digital distribution and low-cost print editions. The publishers and the series editors are committed to the principle that knowledge should freely circulate and have embraced the use of technology to support open access to scholarly work.

Recent Books in the Series

Amy Cicchino and Troy Hicks (Eds.), *Better Practices: Exploring the Teaching of Writing in Online and Hybrid Spaces* (2024)

Geneesa M. Carter and Aurora Matzke (Eds.), *Systems Shift: Creating and Navigating Change in Rhetoric and Composition Administration* (2023)

Michael J. Michaud, *A Writer Reforms (the Teaching of) Writing: Donald Murray and the Writing Process Movement, 1963–1987* (2023)

Michelle LaFrance and Melissa Nicolas ((Eds.), *Institutional Ethnography as Writing Studies Practice* (2023)

Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver (Eds.), *Rethinking Peer Review: Critical Reflections on a Pedagogical Practice* (2023)

Megan J. Kelly, Heather M. Falconer, Caleb L. González, and Jill Dahlman (Eds.), *Adapting the Past to Reimagine Possible Futures: Celebrating and Critiquing WAC at 50* (2023)

William J. Macauley, Jr. et al. (Eds.), *Threshold Conscripts: Rhetoric and Composition Teaching Assistantships* (2023)

Jennifer Grouling, *Adapting VALUEs: Tracing the Life of a Rubric through Institutional Ethnography* (2022)

Chris M. Anson and Pamela Flash (Eds.), *Writing-Enriched Curricula: Models of Faculty-Driven and Departmental Transformation* (2021)

Asao B. Inoue, *Above the Well: An Antiracist Argument From a Boy of Color* (2021)

Alexandria L. Lockett, Iris D. Ruiz, James Chase Sanchez, and Christopher Carter (Eds.), *Race, Rhetoric, and Research Methods* (2021)

CONSIDERING STUDENTS,
TEACHERS, AND WRITING
ASSESSMENT: VOLUME 1,
TECHNICAL AND POLITICAL
CONTEXTS

Edited by Diane Kelly-Riley, Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus

The WAC Clearinghouse
wac.colostate.edu
Fort Collins, Colorado

University Press of Colorado
upcolorado.com
Denver, Colorado

The WAC Clearinghouse, Fort Collins, Colorado 80523

University Press of Colorado, Denver, Colorado 80202

© 2024 by Diane Kelly-Riley, Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International license.

ISBN 978-1-64215-216-6 (PDF) 978-1-64215-217-3 (ePub) 978-1-64642-619-5 (pbk.)

DOI 10.37514/PER-B.2024.2166

Produced in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Pending

Copyeditor: Andrea Bennett

Designer: Mike Palmquist

Cover Photo: Image by Rawpixel.com. Image ID 13081212.

Series Editors: Rich Rice and J. Michael Rifenburg

Consulting Editor: Susan H. McLeod

Associate Editors: Jonathan M. Marine, Johanna Phelps, and Qingyang Sun

The WAC Clearinghouse supports teachers of writing across the disciplines. Hosted by Colorado State University, it brings together scholarly journals and book series as well as resources for teachers who use writing in their courses. This book is available in digital formats for free download at wac.colostate.edu.

Founded in 1965, the University Press of Colorado is a nonprofit cooperative publishing enterprise supported, in part, by Adams State University, Colorado State University, Fort Lewis College, Metropolitan State University of Denver, University of Alaska Fairbanks, University of Colorado, University of Denver, University of Northern Colorado, University of Wyoming, Utah State University, and Western Colorado University. For more information, visit upcolorado.com.

Citation Information: Kelly-Riley, Diane, Ti Macklin, & Carl Whithaus (Eds.). (2024). *Considering Students, Teachers, and Writing Assessment: Volume 1, Technical and Political Contexts*. The WAC Clearinghouse; University Press of Colorado. <https://doi.org/10.37514/PER-B.2024.2166>

Land Acknowledgment. The Colorado State University Land Acknowledgment can be found at landacknowledgment.colostate.edu.

CONTENTS

Foreword	vii	
Kathleen Blake Yancey and Brian Huot		
Introduction to Volume 1, Technical and Political Contexts	3	
Diane Kelly-Riley, Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus		
PART 1. TECHNICAL ISSUES IN THE ASSESSMENT OF WRITING: RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY		17
Retrospective. From Isolation to Integration: Technical Issues in the Assessment of Writing	19	
David H. Slomp		
Chapter 1. Reframing Reliability for Writing Assessment	37	
Peggy O'Neill		
Chapter 2. Validity Inquiry of Race and Shared Evaluation Practices in a Large-Scale, University-Wide Writing Portfolio Assessment	65	
Diane Kelly-Riley		
Chapter 3. Three Interpretative Frameworks: Assessment of English Language Arts-Writing in the Common Core State Standards Initiative	93	
Norbert Elliot, Andre A. Rupp, and David M. Williamson		
PART 2. POLITICS AND PUBLIC POLICY OF LARGE-SCALE WRITING ASSESSMENT		123
Retrospective. The Politics and Public Policy of Large-Scale Writing Assessment	125	
Carolyn Calhoun-Dillahunt		
Chapter 4. The Misuse of Writing Assessment for Political Purposes.	143	
Edward M. White		
Chapter 5. Issues in Large-Scale Writing Assessment: Perspectives from the National Assessment of Educational Progress	161	
Arthur N. Applebee		
Chapter 6. The Micropolitics of Pathways: Teacher Education, Writing Assessment, and the Common Core.	183	
J. W. Hammond and Merideth Garcia		
Chapter 7. Writing Assessment, Placement, and the Two-Year College	209	
Christie Toth, Jessica Nastal, Holly Hassel, and Joanne Baird Giordano		

Contents

PART 3. IMPLICATIONS OF AUTOMATED SCORING OF WRITING 233

Retrospective. Implications of Automated Scoring of Writing 235
 Laura Aull

Chapter 8. Validity of Automated Scoring: Prologue for a Continuing
Discussion of Machine Scoring Student Writing 253
 Michael Williamson

Chapter 9. Critique of Mark D. Shermis and Ben Hamner, “Contrasting
State-of-the-Art Automated Scoring of Essays: Analysis” 277
 Les C. Perelman

Chapter 10. Globalizing Plagiarism and Writing Assessment: A Case
Study of Turnitin 295
 Jordan Canzonetta and Vani Kannan

Editors and Retrospective Contributors 317