

# CONSIDERING STUDENTS, TEACHERS, AND WRITING ASSESSMENT

VOLUME 1, TECHNICAL  
AND POLITICAL CONTEXTS



Perspectives  
on Writing

Edited by  
Diane Kelly-Riley  
Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus



CONSIDERING STUDENTS,  
TEACHERS, AND WRITING  
ASSESSMENT: VOLUME 1,  
TECHNICAL AND POLITICAL  
CONTEXTS

## PERSPECTIVES ON WRITING

Series Editors: Rich Rice and J. Michael Rifenburg

Consulting Editor: Susan H. McLeod

Associate Editors: Jonathan M. Marine, Johanna Phelps, and Qingyang Sun

The Perspectives on Writing series addresses writing studies in a broad sense. Consistent with the wide ranging approaches characteristic of teaching and scholarship in writing across the curriculum, the series presents works that take divergent perspectives on working as a writer, teaching writing, administering writing programs, and studying writing in its various forms.

The WAC Clearinghouse and University Press of Colorado are collaborating so that these books will be widely available through free digital distribution and low-cost print editions. The publishers and the series editors are committed to the principle that knowledge should freely circulate and have embraced the use of technology to support open access to scholarly work.

### Recent Books in the Series

Amy Cicchino and Troy Hicks (Eds.), *Better Practices: Exploring the Teaching of Writing in Online and Hybrid Spaces* (2024)

Genesea M. Carter and Aurora Matzke (Eds.), *Systems Shift: Creating and Navigating Change in Rhetoric and Composition Administration* (2023)

Michael J. Michaud, *A Writer Reforms (the Teaching of) Writing: Donald Murray and the Writing Process Movement, 1963–1987* (2023)

Michelle LaFrance and Melissa Nicolas ((Eds.), *Institutional Ethnography as Writing Studies Practice* (2023)

Phoebe Jackson and Christopher Weaver (Eds.), *Rethinking Peer Review: Critical Reflections on a Pedagogical Practice* (2023)

Megan J. Kelly, Heather M. Falconer, Caleb L. González, and Jill Dahlman (Eds.), *Adapting the Past to Reimagine Possible Futures: Celebrating and Critiquing WAC at 50* (2023)

William J. Macauley, Jr. et al. (Eds.), *Threshold Conscripts: Rhetoric and Composition Teaching Assistantships* (2023)

Jennifer Grouling, *Adapting VALUEs: Tracing the Life of a Rubric through Institutional Ethnography* (2022)

Chris M. Anson and Pamela Flash (Eds.), *Writing-Enriched Curricula: Models of Faculty-Driven and Departmental Transformation* (2021)

Asao B. Inoue, *Above the Well: An Antiracist Argument From a Boy of Color* (2021)

Alexandria L. Lockett, Iris D. Ruiz, James Chase Sanchez, and Christopher Carter (Eds.), *Race, Rhetoric, and Research Methods* (2021)

# CONSIDERING STUDENTS, TEACHERS, AND WRITING ASSESSMENT: VOLUME 1, TECHNICAL AND POLITICAL CONTEXTS

Edited by Diane Kelly-Riley, Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus

The WAC Clearinghouse  
[wac.colostate.edu](http://wac.colostate.edu)  
Fort Collins, Colorado

University Press of Colorado  
[upcolorado.com](http://upcolorado.com)  
Denver, Colorado

The WAC Clearinghouse, Fort Collins, Colorado 80523

University Press of Colorado, Denver, Colorado 80202

© 2024 by Diane Kelly-Riley, Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International license.

ISBN 978-1-64215-216-6 (PDF) 978-1-64215-217-3 (ePub) 978-1-64642-619-5 (pbk.)

DOI 10.37514/PER-B.2024.2166

Produced in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kelly-Riley, Diane, editor. | Macklin, Tialitha M. (Tialitha Michelle), 1977- editor. | Whithaus, Carl, editor.

Title: Considering students, teachers, and writing assessment / edited by Diane Kelly-Riley, Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus.

Description: Fort Collins, Colorado : The WAC Clearinghouse ; Denver, Colorado : University Press of Colorado, 2024. | Series: Perspectives on writing | Includes bibliographical references. | Contents: v. 1. Technical and political contexts -- v. 2. Emerging theoretical and pedagogical practices.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024013164 (print) | LCCN 2024013165 (ebook) | ISBN 9781646426195 (v. 1 ; paperback) | ISBN 9781646426713 (v. 2 ; paperback) | ISBN 9781642152166 (v. 1 ; adobe pdf) | ISBN 9781642152173 (v. 1 ; epub) | ISBN 9781642152326 (v. 2 ; adobe pdf) | ISBN 9781642152333 (v. 2 ; epub)

Subjects: LCSH: English language--Rhetoric--Study and teaching--Evaluation. | English language--Rhetoric--Study and teaching--Social aspects. | English language--Rhetoric--Study and teaching--Political aspects. | English language--Composition and exercises--Evaluation | English language--Composition and exercises--Social aspects. | English language--Composition and exercises--Political aspects. | LCGFT: Essays.

Classification: LCC PE1404 .C63374 2024 (print) | LCC PE1404 (ebook) | DDC 808/.042071073--dc23/eng/20240507

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024013164>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2024013165>

Copyeditor: Andrea Bennett

Designer: Mike Palmquist

Cover Photo: Image by Rawpixel.com. Image ID 13081212.

Series Editors: Rich Rice and J. Michael Rifenburg

Consulting Editor: Susan H. McLeod

Associate Editors: Jonathan M. Marine, Johanna Phelps, and Qingyang Sun

The WAC Clearinghouse supports teachers of writing across the disciplines. Hosted by Colorado State University, it brings together scholarly journals and book series as well as resources for teachers who use writing in their courses. This book is available in digital formats for free download at [wac.colostate.edu](http://wac.colostate.edu).

Founded in 1965, the University Press of Colorado is a nonprofit cooperative publishing enterprise supported, in part, by Adams State University, Colorado State University, Fort Lewis College, Metropolitan State University of Denver, University of Alaska Fairbanks, University of Colorado, University of Denver, University of Northern Colorado, University of Wyoming, Utah State University, and Western Colorado University. For more information, visit [upcolorado.com](http://upcolorado.com).

**Citation Information:** Kelly-Riley, Diane, Ti Macklin, & Carl Whithaus (Eds.). (2024). *Considering Students, Teachers, and Writing Assessment: Volume 1, Technical and Political Contexts*. The WAC Clearinghouse; University Press of Colorado. <https://doi.org/10.37514/PER-B.2024.2166>

**Land Acknowledgment.** The Colorado State University Land Acknowledgment can be found at [landacknowledgment.colostate.edu](http://landacknowledgment.colostate.edu).

# CONTENTS

Foreword . . . . .	vii
Kathleen Blake Yancey and Brian Huot	
Introduction to Volume 1, Technical and Political Contexts . . . . .	3
Diane Kelly-Riley, Ti Macklin, and Carl Whithaus	
PART 1. TECHNICAL ISSUES IN THE ASSESSMENT OF WRITING:	
RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY . . . . .	17
Retrospective. From Isolation to Integration: Technical Issues in the Assessment of Writing . . . . .	19
David H. Slomp	
Chapter 1. Reframing Reliability for Writing Assessment . . . . .	37
Peggy O'Neill	
Chapter 2. Validity Inquiry of Race and Shared Evaluation Practices in a Large-Scale, University-Wide Writing Portfolio Assessment . . . . .	65
Diane Kelly-Riley	
Chapter 3. Three Interpretative Frameworks: Assessment of English Language Arts-Writing in the Common Core State Standards Initiative . . . .	93
Norbert Elliot, Andre A. Rupp, and David M. Williamson	
PART 2. POLITICS AND PUBLIC POLICY OF LARGE-SCALE WRITING	
ASSESSMENT . . . . .	123
Retrospective. The Politics and Public Policy of Large-Scale Writing Assessment . . . . .	125
Carolyn Calhoun-Dillahunt	
Chapter 4. The Misuse of Writing Assessment for Political Purposes. . . . .	143
Edward M. White	
Chapter 5. Issues in Large-Scale Writing Assessment: Perspectives from the National Assessment of Educational Progress . . . . .	161
Arthur N. Applebee	
Chapter 6. The Micropolitics of Pathways: Teacher Education, Writing Assessment, and the Common Core. . . . .	183
J. W. Hammond and Merideth Garcia	
Chapter 7. Writing Assessment, Placement, and the Two-Year College . . . .	209
Christie Toth, Jessica Nastal, Holly Hassel, and Joanne Baird Giordano	

PART 3. IMPLICATIONS OF AUTOMATED SCORING OF WRITING . . . . .	233
Retrospective. Implications of Automated Scoring of Writing . . . . .	235
Laura Aull	
Chapter 8. Validity of Automated Scoring: Prologue for a Continuing Discussion of Machine Scoring Student Writing . . . . .	253
Michael Williamson	
Chapter 9. Critique of Mark D. Shermis and Ben Hamner, “Contrasting State-of-the-Art Automated Scoring of Essays: Analysis” . . . . .	277
Les C. Perelman	
Chapter 10. Globalizing Plagiarism and Writing Assessment: A Case Study of Turnitin . . . . .	295
Jordan Canzonetta and Vani Kannan	
Editors and Retrospective Contributors . . . . .	317