Problems into PROBLEMS: A Rhetoric of Motivation

Joseph M. Williams
PRACTICE & PEDAGOGY

Series Editor, Mike Palmquist

The Practice and Pedagogy series offers occasional publications by the WAC Clearinghouse. Books in the series range from scholarly monographs to republished textbooks to edited collections. The series provides an opportunity to explore the intersections of theory and practice in the daily work of writers and teachers of writing.

The WAC Clearinghouse makes books in the series available in open-access formats. As teachers and researchers of writing, the members of the Clearinghouse are committed to the principle that scholarly work should be available to all who seek access to it. We offer this series to expand access to good work and good ideas.

OTHER BOOKS IN THE SERIES

*A New Literacies Dictionary: Primer for the Twenty-first Century Learner*, by Adam Mackie

*Toward a Taxonomy of “Small Genres” for Writing Across the Curriculum*, by Richard E. Young

*The Informed Writer: Using Sources in the Disciplines*, by Charles Bazerman

*Learning Re-abled: The Learning Disability Controversy and Composition Studies*, by Patricia A. Dunn
The WAC Clearinghouse supports teachers of writing across the disciplines. Hosted by Colorado State University, it brings together scholarly journals and book series as well as resources for teachers who use writing in their courses. This book is available in digital format for free download at http://wac.colostate.edu/books.
## Table of Contents

Series Editor’s Introduction ................................................................. ix  
Introduction ........................................................................................ 1  
Problems Rhetorical and Substantive ............................................... 1  
Work on Introductions and Problems ........................................... 2  
The Consequences of our Ignorance .............................................. 4  
Part I. The Structure of Problems and PROBLEMS ............................... 7  
1. Cognitive Structure ..................................................................... 7  
   A Definition of Problem: Two Necessary Elements ..................... 9  
   Transforming a Problem into a PROBLEM ................................. 12  
2. Introductions and the Rhetorical Construction of a PROBLEM 14  
   A First Approximation .............................................................. 14  
   Variations ................................................................................... 16  
   Privileging and Prototype Semantics ......................................... 18  
   Privileged Order and Content in Language ............................... 20  
   The Prototypical Structures of Larger Units of Discourse .......... 21  
   The Fixed and Variable Bi-level Structure of Introductions ...... 23  
   The Structure of Introductions and Story Grammars .............. 27  
   Some Illustrations ..................................................................... 30  
   Variety vs. Monotony: PROBLEM-posing vs. Information-Providing ................................................................. 32  
Part II. Reading, Learning, Teaching ................................................. 39  
1. Reading and Responding to Introductions ................................. 39
Problems into PROBLEMS

Introductions as Evidence of Socialization ................................. 40
Correlations between Introductions and Judgments of Holistic Quality ................................................................. 43
Controlled Observations ......................................................... 45

2. Student Judgments about the Importance of PROBLEMS .... 47
3. Two Obstacles to Teaching and Learning PROBLEMS .......... 49
   Why Our Students Think They Write .................................. 49
   The Contrasting Phenomenology of Costs and Conditions ..... 52

Part III. Teaching and Further Research .................................. 63
1. Pedagogy ............................................................................. 63
   Intrinsic Constraints and Created Boundaries ..................... 63
   Classroom Practices ............................................................ 67
2. Further questions .................................................................. 75

Conclusion .................................................................................. 81
Footnotes ................................................................................... 83
Appendix .................................................................................... 89
Works Cited ............................................................................... 91