Alternatives to Grading
Student Writing
NCTE Editorial Board: Pat Cordeiro, Colette Daiute, Bobbi Fisher, Brenda Greene, Richard Luckert, Bill McBride, Alleen Pace Nilsen, Jerrie Cobb Scott, Karen Smith, Chair, ex officio, Michael Greer, ex officio

NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing

Robert Baroz, Ripton, Vermont
Nick Carbone, University of Massachusetts at Amherst
Mary Beth Cody, University of Nevada, Reno
Marilyn Cooper, Michigan Technological University, Houghton
Alice Cross, Horace Greeley High School, Chappaqua, New York
Dallas Davies, Fremont High School, Sunnyvale, California
Carol Dietrich, DeVry Institute of Technology, Columbus, Ohio
Pamela Childers, The McCallie School, Chattanooga, Tennessee
Elizabeth Hodges, Virginia Commonwealth University, Richmond
Gwendolyn Jones, Tuskegee Institute, Alabama
Jean Ketter, Grinnell College, Iowa
Immaculate Kizza, University of Tennessee, Chattanooga
Terri LeClercq, University of Texas Law School, Austin
Marie Wilson Nelson, National Louis University, Tampa, Florida
Lynda Radican (Associate Chair), California State University–Sacramento
Joe Strzepek, University of Virginia, Charlottesville
Stephen Tchudi (Chair), University of Nevada, Reno
Alternatives to Grading Student Writing

Edited by

Stephen Tchudi
University of Nevada, Reno

NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing
Manuscript Editor: Robert A. Heister/Humanities & Sciences Associates
Production Editor: Jamie Hutchinson
Interior Design: Doug Burnett
Cover Design: Loren Kirkwood

NCTE Stock Number: 01305-3050

©1997 by the National Council of Teachers of English. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America.

It is the policy of NCTE in its journals and other publications to provide a forum for the open discussion of ideas concerning the content and the teaching of English and the language arts. Publicity accorded to any particular point of view does not imply endorsement by the Executive Committee, the Board of Directors, or the membership at large, except in announcements of policy, where such endorsement is clearly specified.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Alternatives to grading student writing / edited by Stephen Tchudi.
   NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing.
   p. cm.
   Includes bibliographical references.
   1. English language—Composition and exercises—Ability testing—United States. 2. English language—Composition and exercises—Study and teaching—United States—Evaluation. I. Tchudi, Stephen, 1942–. II. NCTE Committee on Alternatives to Grading Student Writing.
LB1576.A6157 1997
808'042'071—dc21 97-10157
CIP
Contents

Introduction: Degrees of Freedom in Assessment, Evaluation, and Grading  ix
Stephen Tchudi

I. Background and Theory

1. It's Broken—Fix It!  3
   Liesel K. O'Hagan
2. Growth-Biased Assessing of Writers—
   A More Democratic Choice  15
   Marie Wilson Nelson

II. Responding to Student Writing

3. Writing Students Need Coaches, Not Judges  35
   Lynn Holaday
4. Response: A Promising Beginning for Learning
   to Grade Student Writing  47
   Carol Beeghly Bencich
5. Can You Be Black and Write and Right?  63
   Elaine B. Richardson
6. Alternative Assessment of Second-Language Writing:
   A Developmental Model  77
   Janis Massa
7. Scribliolink: Inviting Parents to Respond
   to Their Children's Writing  91
   Joyce C. Fine

III. Classroom Strategies and Alternatives
    to Grading Student Writing

8. Student Attitudes toward Grades and Evaluation on Writing  103
   Jean S. Ketter and Judith W. Hunter
9. Writing at Reading: How a Junior Year
    in England Changes Student Writers  122
   Mary B. Guthrow
10. Assessment through Collaborative Critique  
   Sarah Robbins, Sue Poper, and Jennifer Herrod  
   137
11. What Grades Do for Us, and How to Do without Them  
   Marcy Bauman  
   162
12. Seeing How Good We Can Get It  
   Kelly Chandler and Amy Muentener  
   180
13. Grading on Merit and Achievement:  
   Where Quality Meets Quantity  
   Stephen Adkison and Stephen Tchudi  
   192
14. Total Quality: A Farewell to Grades  
   Charles McDonnell  
   210
15. Using a Multidimensional Scoring Guide:  
   A Win-Win Situation  
   Gail M. Young  
   225
16. Students Using Evaluation in Their Writing Process  
   Jacob S. Blumner and Francis Fritz  
   233
17. Unlocking Outcome-Based Education  
   through the Writing Process  
   Rick Pribyl  
   244
18. Portfolio Assessment as an Alternative  
   to Grading Student Writing  
   Kathleen Jones  
   255
19. Issues to Consider when Scoring Student Portfolios  
   Anne Wescott Dodd  
   265

IV. Faculty Workshops in Alternatives  
   to Grading Student Writing

   Developing Intrinsic Motivation for Students' Writing  
   Immaculate Kizza  
   277
   Weighing and Choosing Alternatives  
   Stephen Tchudi  
   281
   Contract Grades: An Agreement between Students and Their Teachers  
   Lynda S. Radican  
   285
   Using Rubrics and Holistic Scoring of Writing  
   Jean S. Ketter  
   291
Contents

Alternative Assessment Methods across the Disciplines 296
Pamela B. Childers

Communicating with Parents and the Public 301
Marilyn M. Cooper

Editor 307