HARVEY J. GRAFF

The Literacy Myth

CULTURAL
INTEGRATION
AND SOCIAL
STRUCTURE
IN THE
NINETEENTH
CENTURY

THE LITERACY MYTH



THE LITERACY MYTH

Cultural Integration and Social Structure in the Nineteenth Century

Harvey J. Graff

With a New Introduction by the Author



Transaction Publishers
New Brunswick (U.S.A.) and London (U.K.)

New material this edition copyright © 1991 by Transaction Publishers, New Brunswick, New Jersey 08903.

Originally published in 1979 by Academic Press, Inc. © Academic Press, Inc. 1979.

All rights reserved under International and Pan-American Copyright Conventions. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher. All inquiries should be addressed to Transaction Publishers, Rutgers—The State University, New Brunswick, New Jersey 08903.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 90-46467

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Graff, Harvey J.

The literacy myth: cultural integration and social structure in the nineteenth century/Harvey J. Graff.

Reprint. Originally published: New York: Academic Press, c1979. Originally published in series: Studies in social discontinuity.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN: 978-0-88738-884-2

1. Literacy-Ontario-History-19th century. 2. Educational sociology-Ontario-History-19th century. 3. Education, Urban-Ontario-History-19th century. I. Title.

LC154.2.06G72

1991

301-dc20

90-46467

CIP

FOR VICKI



Contents

List of Illustrations and Abbreviations	ix
List of Tables and Figures	xi
Introduction to the Transaction Edition	xiii
Preface Acknowledgments	XXXV
Achiowieughenis	xliii
Introduction to the Original Edition:	
Literacy and History	1
1	
The Moral Bases of Literacy:	
Society, Economy, and Social Order	01
Society, Economy, and Social Order	21
ī	
-	
LITERACY AND SOCIAL STRUCTURE	
IN THE NINETEENTH-CENTURY CITY	

Illiterates and Literates in Urban Society:

The Mid-Nineteenth Century

51

viii	CONTENTS
3 Persistence, Mobility, and Literacy	117
4 The Children of the Illiterate: Education, Work, and Mobility	155
II LITERACY AND SOCIETY	
5 Literacy, Jobs, and Industrialization	195
6 Literacy and Criminality	235
7 Literacy: Quantity and Quality	269
Appendix A Sources for the Historical Study of Literacy in North America and Europe	325
Appendix B Literacy and the Census	329
Appendix C Classification of Occupations	335
Appendix D Illiterates: Occupations, 1861	337
Appendix E A Note on the Record Linkage	341
Subject Index	345

List of Illustrations and Abbreviations

ILLUSTRATIONS

"School Children in Class"	Cover
"The March of Intellect"	Frontispiece
"Certificate of Honour"	32
First Book of Lessons, for the Use of Schools	38
"Thomas Speer Copy Book"	44
"Time Table for a School, 6, 7, or 8 grades"	46
"Ground or Floor Plan," for School Rooms	46
"Map of the Confederate Provinces of British North	
America," 1867	54
"Reader in a Work Group, New York City, cigar factory,	
1909"	214
"Dundas, Ontario: King Street," ca. 1856	307
"Guelph, Ontario, St. George's Square, 1874"	308
"King Street, Toronto, 1870s"	309

ABBREVIATIONS

Journal of Education for Upper Canada	JE
Documentary History of Education for Upper Canada	DHE
Christian Guardian	CG
The Church	TC
Palladium of Labor	POL
The Ontario Workman	OW
Fincher's Trades Review	FTR
Province of Ontario Archives	PAO

List of Tables and Figures

TABLES

2.1	Ethnicity of Adults, 1861	57
2.2	Ages of Adults, 1861	61
2.3	Sex of Adults, 1861	62
2.4	Age by Sex, 1861	64
2.5	Occupational Hierarchy, 1861	73-74
2.6	Occupation by Ethnicity, 1861	78-79
2.7	Index of Occupational Standing	80
2.8	Wealth, Total Annual Value, 1861	85
2.9	Percentage Poor, 1861	86
2.10	Percentage Poor by Occupation, 1861	88
2.11	Percentage Poor by Occupation and Ethnicity, 1861	89
2.12	Homeownership, 1861	95
2.13	Homeownership by Ethnicity, 1861	97
2.14	Homeownership by Wealth, 1861	99
2.15	Homeownership by Age, 1861	100
2.16	Homeownership by Family Size, 1861	100
2.17	Marital Status by Age, 1861	104
2.18	Illiterate-Literate Marriage, Residence Patterns, 1861	105
2.19	Household Characteristics, 1861	107
2.20	Fertility Ratios, 1861	110
2.21	Number of Children by Age, 1861	111
2.22	Family Size by Wealth, 1861	113
3.1	Industrial Development, 1871	120
3.2	Persistence: Heads of Households, Census 1861—Assessment 1861	125
3.3	Persistence: Illiterates, 1861–1871	127
3.4	Persistence: Illiterate Heads of Household, 1861–1871	131
3.5	Illiterate Occupational Mobility, 1861–1871	134
3.6	Illiterate Economic Mobility, 1861–1871	137
3.7	Occupational and Economic Mobility, 1861–1871	137
3.8	Homeownership—Property Mobility 1861–1871	139

3.9	Economic and Property Mobility, 1861-1871	143
	Occupational Status, 1871	147
	Wealth of Illiterates, 1871	148
3.12	Household Summary Data, 1871	150-151
4.1	School Attendance, 1861, by Head of Household Characteristics	162
4.2	Children at Home, 1861	172-173
4.3	Occupation of Children Residing at Home, 1861 and 1871	176
4.4	Children of Illiterates, 1871	181
4.5	Intergenerational Occupational Mobility, 1861	184-185
4.6	Intergenerational Occupational Mobility, 1871	188
5.1	Illiterates: Selected Occupations, 1861	199
5.2	Occupational Classification and Literacy: Hawkesbury	
	Lumber Company	219
5.3	Rates of Wage and Literacy	220
5.4	Literacy of Workforce	220
5.5	Wage Differentials and Literacy	221
5.6	Changing Wage Rates: Employees with Two or More Contracts	223
6.1	Literacy of Middlesex Criminals	253
6.2	Rate of Conviction for Each Ethnic Group, Controlling for Level	
	of Literacy	259
6.3	Middlesex Criminals: Ethnicity by Literacy	260
6.4	Rate of Conviction for Each Occupational Category, Controlling for	
	Level of Literacy	262
6.5	Rate of Conviction for Each Sex, Controlling for Level of Literacy	263
6.6	Rate of Conviction for Each Category of Crime, Controlling	004
67	for Level of Literacy	264 265
6.7	Middlesex Criminals: Crime by Literacy	209
FIC	GURES	
2.1	Age-Sex Structure, 1861	64
2.2	Occupation by Age, 1861	82
4.1	School Attendance by Age, 1861	170